BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03326 8459

KF
9309
O57
c.2

Ontario. Royal Commission
of Inquiry into Certain
Deaths at the Hospital
for Sick Children and
Related Matters.
Report ...

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/reportofroyalcom00onta_1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

COMMISSION STAFF ix

LIST OF COUNSEL x

LIST OF WITNESSES xii
  (a) PHASE I xii
  (b) PHASE II .xvii

THE REPORT

A. INTRODUCTION 1
  1. THE STORY IN OUTLINE 1
  2. THE COMMISSION 2

B. THE CAUSE OF DEATH - PHASE I 7
  3. STATISTICS 7
    (a) The Wards. 7
    (b) The Times. 8
    (c) Personnel. 8
    (d) Conclusions. 8
  4. THE DEATHS, THE HOSPITAL, ITS STAFF AND THEIR CONCERNS. 10
  5. DIGOXIN, ITS PROPERTIES. 15
    (a) History. 15
    (b) Function 15
    (c) Pathology. 15
    (d) Methods of Administration. 16
    (e) Its Operation. 17
    (f) Its Distribution, the Alpha Phase. . 17
    (g) Its Excretion, the Beta Phase. . . . 18
    (h) Symptoms of Toxicity and Use of Digoxin for Therapeutic Purposes. . 18
  6. DIGOXIN, ITS TESTING 20
    (a) History and Acceptable Levels. . . . 20
    (b) The Taking of Tests or Levels. . . . 20
    (c) The Methods of Testing 21
      i) RIA 21
      ii) FPIA. 22

iii) HPLC. 22
iv) GC/MS 22

(d) Testing by the Hospital for Sick Children and the Centre of Forensic Sciences 23
(e) Tissue Samples 24
(f) Substance X. 25
(g) Other Interpretation Problems. . . . 27
(h) Post-Mortem Factor 27
(i) Recent Developments and Conclusions. 29

7. THE EXPERTS. 32
(a) Cardiology 32
(b) Pathology. 33
(c) Pharmacology 33
(d) Biochemistry 34
(e) Toxicology 34
(f) Epidemiology and the Atlanta Report. 34
(g) Other Experts. 37

8. MEDICATION ERROR AND THE THEORY OF ACCIDENT 38

9. THE HEART AND ITS FUNCTION 42

10. THE CHILDREN 44
(A) General. 44
(B) Specifics. 49
(1) Laura Woodcock 49
(2) Alan Perreault 52
(3) Andrew Bilodeau. 54
(4) David Taylor 56
(5) Amber Dawson 59
(6) Lillian Hoos 63
(7) Philip Turner. 65
(8) Dion Shrum 67
(9) Kelly Ann Monteith 70
(10) Paul Murphy. 72
(11) Antonio Velasquez. 74
(12) Lauretta Heyworth. 77
(13) Brian Gage 79
(14) Richard McKeil 81
(15) Antonio Adamo. 84
(16) Francis Volk 86
(17) Matthew Lutes. 88
(18) John Onofre. 90
(19) Darcy MacDonald. 93
(20) Real Gosselin. 95

(21) Stephanie Lombardo 98
(22) Jesse Belanger 102
(23) Janice Estrella. 105
(24) Frank Fazio. 111
(25) Bruce Floryn 113
(26) Jennifer Thomas. 115
(27) David Leith. 117
(28) Colleen Warner 119
(29) Jordan Hines 121
(30) Barbara Gionas 127
(31) Michelle Manojlovich 130
(32) Kevin Pacsai 133
(33) Kristin Inwood 141
(34) Charlon Gardner. 145
(35) Allana Miller. 147
(36) Justin Cook. 152

11. THE CONSIDERATIONS LEADING TO THE CONCLUSIONS 157
(a) The Categories 157
(b) Onus 158
(c) Meaning of Categories. 159
(d) Credibility of Witnesses 160
(e) Severity of Illness and Autopsy Findings. 160
(f) Recommendations. 161

12. THE CONCLUSIONS ON PHASE I 162
(a) Deaths by Digoxin Toxicity 162
(b) Natural Deaths 165
(c) Highly Suspicious Deaths 166
(d) Suspicious Deaths. 167
(e) Undesignated Deaths. 169
(f) Summary. 170

C. THE INVESTIGATION AND PROSECUTION - PHASE II 173

13. THE FACTS UP TO THE ARREST 173
(a) The Coroners 173
(b) The Police 175
(c) The Nurses 182

14. THE ARREST 185

15. THE EVENTS IMMEDIATELY SUBSEQUENT TO THE ARREST. 189

16. THE INVESTIGATION TO THE COMMENCEMENT OF THE PRELIMINARY INQUIRY. 195

17. THE PRELIMINARY INQUIRY. 201

18. THE JURISDICTIONAL QUESTIONS 208

19. THE CONCLUSIONS ON PHASE II. 214
    (a) The Standards. 214
    (b) The Hospital and the Doctors 214
    (c) The Nurses 215
    (d) The Coroners 215
    (e) Susan Nelles 216
    (f) The Police 217
    (g) The Crown. 219
    (h) Compensation 220

EPILOGUE 223

APPENDICES

1. ORDER-IN-COUNCIL 227

2. AMENDING ORDER-IN-COUNCIL. 231

3. REASONS FOR JUDGMENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL 233

4. STATEMENT OF CLAIM - _Nelles v. The Queen et al_. 254

5. CHART OF CARDIOLOGY WARD DEATHS OCCURRING ANYWHERE IN THE HOSPITAL. 263

6. CHART OF DEATHS OCCURRING ON WARDS 4A AND 4B 265

7. CHART OF DEATHS BY TIME FROM 2400 TO 0600. 267

8. CHART OF DEATHS BY TIME FROM 0100 to 0500. 269

9. SUMMARY OF ATLANTA REPORT FINDINGS 271

10. LIST OF EXPERT WITNESSES IN PHASE I. . . . 273

11. DIAGRAM OF THE NORMAL HEART. 277

12. DIAGRAM OF THE CIRCULATION OF THE HEART. . 279

13. GLOSSARY OF MEDICAL TERMS. 280